

Data Submitted (UTC 11): 3/16/2022 4:00:00 AM

First name: Brownie

Last name: Newman

Organization: Buncombe County Board of Commissioners

Title: Chairperson

Comments: USDA Forest Service, Southern Region:

Attached please find the Buncombe County Commission's Objection to the Revised Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision and a Resolution from that Board authorizing said Objection.

Please send communications regarding this matter as follows:

Brownie Newman

Commission Chair

Brownie.Newman@buncombecounty.org

With copy to:

Michael C. Frue

County Attorney

Michael.Frue@buncombecounty.org

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE

UNITED STATES FOREST SERVICE

March 15, 2022

Objection to the Revised Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision:

OBJECTOR

Buncombe County Commission Brownie Newman, Chair

200 College Street, Suite 300

Asheville, NC 28801 brownie.newman@buncmbecounty.org

NOTICE OF OBJECTION AND STATEMENT OF REASONS

Submitted via electronic portal:

Nantahala and Pisgah National Forests Plan Revision Objection

Ken Arney Regional Forester

USDA Forest Service Southern Region

1720 Peachtree Road NW Suite 760S

Atlanta, GA 30309

James Melonas Forest Supervisor

United States Forest Service ATTN: Objection Coordinator 160 Zillicoa Street, Suite A Asheville, NC 28801

cc: Randy Moore, Forest Service Chief, U.S. Forest Service Headquarters, 1400 Independence Avenue, SW, Washington, D.C., 20250-0003

NOTICE OF OBJECTION

Pursuant to 36 C.F.R. [sect] 219, Subpart B, the above party objects to the Nantahala and Pisgah Revised Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision. The Responsible Official is James Melonas, Forest Supervisor, and the Reviewing Officer is Ken Amey, Regional Forester. The Nantahala and Pisgah Revised Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision were published on January 21, 2022, with public notice appearing in the Asheville Citizen Times, initiating a 60-day objection period. This objection is timely.

PREVIOUS COMMENTS

The Buncombe County Commission has submitted previous substantive formal comments during public comment periods for the Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan. The previous comments were within the scope of the proposed plan, specific to the plan, and had a direct relationship to the plan.

Specifically, the Buncombe County Commission submitted two unanimous bipartisan resolutions supporting the protection of the entire Craggy/Big Ivy area, including the Ivy Knob, Snowball Mountain, Ox Creek, and Shope Creek portions. It additionally recommended the Craggy Wilderness and National Scenic Area and encouraged the U.S. Forest Service to support these designations. It highlighted the widespread public support and the long history of local community support for protecting all of Big Ivy. Buncombe County supported the protection of the entire Big Ivy area not only because of its incomparable scenic value, but also because of the entire area's importance for protecting water quality, its old-growth forests and other biological values, and its world-class recreational setting and experience.

Both resolutions that were passed by the Buncombe County Commission in 2016 and 2020 included detailed and substantive comments describing the unique conservation attributes of the Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest. These attributes were neither protected nor analyzed in the ROD and FEIS. Additionally, the Forest Service chose not to even study the Craggy National Scenic Area proposal recommended by the Buncombe County Commission but offered no explanation for this decision.

SUMMARY OF OBJECTION

Buncombe County is the most populous county within the 18-county footprint of the Nantahala-Pisgah Forest Plan. Its county seat is Asheville, the largest city in the Pisgah-Nantahala Forest Plan's footprint.

Buncombe County's economy is especially dependent on recreation, tourism, and scenery. Over 70 miles of the Blue Ridge Parkway pass through Buncombe County, including the most visited sections of the Blue Ridge Parkway. Craggy Gardens is the most popular and photographed spot along the Parkway and an important part of Buncombe County's recreation and tourism. Over 500,000 visitors travel to Craggy Gardens each year for its scenic views.

The Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest is most of the Craggy viewshed. The Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest also provides the drinking water for the rapidly growing town of Weaverville and the surrounding area. Buncombe County's water quality and supply is especially important to sustaining its future.

The Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest is also home to Buncombe County's last and only old-growth forests. Over 1,500 acres of these ancient forests have been placed in management areas considered "suitable for timber production," where the Forest Service has prioritized logging. The plan states misleadingly that future projects will not be proposed for the "primary" purpose of timber production, but makes clear that logging and road construction would nevertheless occur in order to meet both acreage and timber volume targets-i.e., timber production. The plan does not provide guidelines requiring the protection of old growth, rare biological values, or unroaded areas within areas considered suitable for timber production.

The Forest Service failed to consider the impact of its management allocations on Buncombe County. It failed to properly analyze as a reasonable alternative the protection of the entire area for its scenic, water, biological, and recreational values, including over 4,000 acres in the Ivy Knob, Snowball Mountain, Ox Creek, and Shope Creek portions of the Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest. The Forest Service also improperly failed to include these key conservation and recreation areas in its Forest Scenic Area designation. The Forest Service also failed to fully consider and analyze the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area with embedded wilderness designation for an expanded Craggy Mountain Wilderness Area..

Buncombe County seeks a change to the final plan that would include those 4,000 acres of Snowball Mountain, North Fork, Shope Creek, and Ox Creek in its Forest Scenic Area and fully consider recommending the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area.

REASONS FOR OBJECTION

The 16,000-acre Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest is a unique and special section of the Pisgah Nantahala National Forest that has widespread public, political, stakeholder, and local community support to be designated a Craggy National Scenic Area.

The Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest includes world-class trails, waterfalls, panoramic views, trout streams, and ancient forests-just 15 miles from downtown Asheville, N.C. Craggy is one of the largest old-growth forests in the East, home to dozens of rare and endangered species. It also boasts some of the steepest downhill mountain biking and best trail running in the country. Climbers ascend sheer granite faces, and hikers trek beneath ancient trees and emerald spruce-fir forests.

The 1,000-mile Mountains to Sea Trail-North Carolina's state trail, stretching from the Smokies to the Outer Banks-rolls along Craggy's ridgeline. Craggy/Big Ivy also includes the mile-high, 360-degree views from Craggy Gardens and Craggy Pinnacle along the Blue Ridge Parkway.

Water abounds in Craggy, including 70-foot Douglas Falls. Native brook trout shelter in cold headwater streams, which supply drinking water to Weaverville and Mars Hill, two rapidly growing municipalities. That water is also important to area farmers and communities.

The Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah has superlative scenic character and integrity with recreational and economic importance. Over 500,000 visitors per year enjoy this area's scenic grandeur from the Blue Ridge Parkway. Around 5,000 drivers each day are greeted by the Craggy

viewshed as they travel to Buncombe and Madison Counties from the north. 92% of the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area is visible from just a few popular and close-by vantage points and the immediate quarter-mile foreground of roads and trails.

Craggy/Big Ivy is surrounded by over 100,000 acres of protected wildlands, including national parklands, private conservation easements, state parklands, and two protected municipal water supplies.

Craggy/Big Ivy includes nearly 5,000 acres of State Natural Heritage Areas and a designated Research Natural Area. Craggy/Big Ivy also features some of the region's best examples of rich cove forest. Nearly every major ecozone occurs in Big Ivy, from spruce-fir forest to bottomland wetlands.

Over 10,000 people submitted comments to the U.S. Forest Service in support of the Craggy National Scenic Area. The Craggy National Scenic Area has also received unanimous bipartisan resolutions of support from the Buncombe County Commission and Asheville City Council, and over 150 local businesses and organizations support the Craggy National Scenic Area. In addition, the full Craggy National Scenic Area also has the full and immediate endorsement of the Nantahala-Pisgah Forest Partnership-a coalition of 30 diverse organizations who have been working together to find common ground on the Pisgah-Nantahala National Forest since 2013.

The Nantahala Pisgah Forest forest plan excludes 4,000 acres and places it in its highest-priority logging

designation. These highest-priority logging areas in Craggy/Big Ivy include 1,500 acres of old-growth forest, the headwaters of the Ivy River (the drinking water source for the town of Weaverville), and the Snowball Trail, one of the most popular trails along the Blue Ridge Parkway. The Craggy National Scenic Area designation was also dismissed and never shared by the Forest Service without any explanation.

The best and highest use of Craggy/Big Ivy is as a Forest Scenic Area/National Scenic Area that protects this world-class viewshed, ancient forest, rare species refuge, recreational hub, and critical drinking water supply for Buncombe County.

1. The Forest plan failed to properly analyze 4,000 acres of Craggy/Big Ivy.

The U.S. Forest Service failed to adequately analyze 4,000 acres of the most important recreation and conservation areas in the Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest.

The Matrix Management Area designation for 4,000 acres of Craggy overlooks multiple detailed comments from biologists, botanists, recreation leaders, and the local community highlighting the Forest Service's inadequate and inaccurate assessments of the Snowball, North Fork, Shope Creek, and Ox Creek sections of Craggy.

Rather than ground-truth and properly analyze the important values submitted by Buncombe County and its residents, the Forest Service delineated a scenic area based on a desktop analysis of visibility from a portion of the Blue Ridge Parkway. The Forest Service did not consider scenic

integrity based on other significant vantage points, even though a field-verified scenic viewshed analysis was available and submitted along with the County's resolution. Moreover, the Forest Service failed to consider the importance of the full area for protecting water resources, biological values, and recreation.

The inadequate and inaccurate analysis of Craggy failed to include any consideration of the following key attributes of the 4,000 acres placed in Matrix Management Area:

1. The significance of protecting the Ivy River headwaters. The Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest is the headwaters for the Ivy River, the drinking water supply for the town of Weaverville, N.C. Craggy's headwaters also provide an alternate drinking water supply for the town of Mars Hill, and the Ivy River headwaters are also interconnected to the Asheville water system.

The Town of Weaverville is experiencing rapid population growth and development, and it is currently evaluating

a multimillion dollar upgrade to its wastewater treatment facility on the Ivy River downstream of Craggy/Big Ivy. Increased sedimentation from active management in Big Ivy will have a significant impact on water treatment facility costs and water quality for tens of thousands downstream.

Guided by North Carolina regulations, in the late 1990s, both Buncombe and Madison Counties developed and enacted watershed protection ordinances controlling land use development and related issues in the watershed area. The Ivy River Source Water Protection Plan was drafted in 2013 and notes the significant impacts of logging on the Ivy River's water quality.

The North Carolina Division of Water Resources, Public Water Supply (PWS) Section, completed in 2010 a Source Water Assessment Report for the Ivy River. The assessment results

indicated an Inherent Vulnerability Rating of Higher due to physical characteristics of the watershed.

The Ivy River also provides water for several local businesses and farms in the local Big Ivy community that have been advocating for stronger protections of the forest since the 1980s. The community of Big Ivy rallied to stop logging projects in the Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest in the 1980s, which led to plan amendment in 1994 that suspended logging in the Big Ivy section of Pisgah.

1. 1,500 acres of old-growth forests. Dr. Alan Smith, emeritus professor of biology at Mars Hill University, has inventoried over 1,500 acres of old-growth in the Snowball and North Fork sections of Big Ivy.
2. Habitat for federally listed endangered species and species of conservation concern. The portions of Craggy placed in Matrix shelter a diversity of wildlife and provide habitat for federally listed species and species of conservation concern, including Carolina Northern flying squirrel, spruce-fir moss spider, rock gnome lichen, Northern long-eared bat, tricolored bat, little brown bat, and cerulean warbler.
3. Four North Carolina Natural Heritage Areas within or adjacent to Craggy. The North Fork section of Craggy shares a boundary with the 700-acre Price Creek/Coxcomb Mountain Natural Heritage Area (2157), with a collective, representational, and overall ranking of High. It also contains the 200-acre Ivy Knob Natural Heritage Area (25) and the 50-acre Ivy Creek Natural Heritage Area. The Snowball section of Craggy shares a boundary with the 500-acre Reems Creek Bowl Natural Heritage Area, which protects the Town of Woodfin's drinking water supply. It also has a collective, representational, and overall rating of High.
4. Scenic Values and Recreational Settings of the Snowball and Big Butt Trails-Snowball Trail is one of the most popular trails along the Blue Ridge Parkway. The Snowball Trail is located near the Craggy Gardens Picnic Area and Visitor Center, two of the most popular destinations along the Blue Ridge Parkway. Over 500,000 people visit this area annually. The Snowball Trail is one of the Parkway's most popular footpaths, stretching six miles along a rolling high-elevation ridgeline. The Snowball Trail includes panoramic vistas from Hawkbill Rock and ends at the Little Snowball Fire Tower cultural heritage site. The Snowball Trail corridor provides habitat for several rare bird and bat species. The Snowball Trail also connects with the Mountains to Sea Trail, North Carolina's State Trail. The Big Butt Trail is contained within the plan's scenic area, but hikers' experiences depend on the viewshed from the trail. The trail's eponymous summit overlooks the Ivy Knob portion of the area, including areas where logging and road construction are anticipated.
5. Little Snowball Fire Tower Heritage Site: The Forest Service analysis of the Craggy/Big Ivy also fails to include any discussion of the Little Snowball Fire Tower site, an important cultural and community site for the Big Ivy

community and the region. A fire tower constructed by the Civilian Conservation Corps was located at the end of Snowball Trail on a panoramic

plateau that is now in the Matrix Management Area. The fire tower was later moved to the Big Ivy

Community Center, but the vantage point remains significant. The tower itself, in its new location, is a source of pride and celebration. Each year, the community opens the fire tower to the public at festivals, and it is the anchor of the Big Ivy Historical Park. The tower is also a significant vantage point of areas that the Forest Service is opening for logging.

1. Shope Creek contains old-growth forest and growing recreation use. Shope Creek shelters old-growth forest and rare communities and is the closest section of national forest to Asheville. It is highly visible from the Blue Ridge Parkway. It contains waterfalls and rare species on its slopes, including several species of declining migratory songbirds like the cerulean warbler. Recent timber harvest resulted not only in harm to recreational and scenic values, but also introduced invasive plants and caused negative changes in forest composition. This area's popularity as an emerging recreation destination outweighs the board feet of timber that can be harvested here. Protecting Shope Creek for its recreation and conservation values should be the highest priority for this section of forest.

2. Ox Creek shares a boundary with the Town of Woodfin Watershed. When logging was proposed previously in the municipal portion of this watershed, massive public outcry resulted in permanently protecting this watershed from logging in 2005. Logging federal lands within this

otherwise protected water supply for a rapidly growing municipality would threaten water quality and raise concerns for the communities it serves.

1. Ox Creek contains a portion of the Mountains to Sea Trail. This 1,175-mile footpath from Clingmans Dome to Jockey's Ridge. It is North Carolina's official state trail and longest marked footpath. Ox Creek is also surrounded by the Blue Ridge Parkway and Southern Appalachian Highlands Conservancy conservation easements.

2. Unanimous local, political, stakeholder, and public support for protecting all of Craggy. The Buncombe County Commission has passed two unanimous bipartisan resolutions in 2016 and again in 2020 supporting the entire 18,000-acre Craggy National Scenic Area. Asheville City Council has also passed a unanimous bipartisan resolution in 2020 supporting the entire Craggy National Scenic Area. Despite including discussion of the area's future management on its agenda multiple times, the County is unaware of any substantial public opposition to the National Scenic Area proposal. Indeed, the County is aware that the Nantahala Pisgah Forest Partnership-a coalition of over 30 diverse organizations, including the forest products industry, hunting organizations, and recreation groups-have fully endorsed the entire Craggy National Scenic Area.

Over 150 local businesses and organizations have also endorsed the entire Craggy National Scenic Area.

In addition, over 300 community members attended a Forest Service meeting at the Craggy/Big Ivy Community Center in February 2015 to support the permanent protection of the Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest. The community center was completely filled and standing room-only, and many additional community members waited outside in the parking lot on a cold winter evening for the opportunity to express

their support for protecting the Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest.

Despite this clear mandate from the local community, political leaders, stakeholders and the public, the FEIS and ROD place over 4,000 acres of Craggy in the Matrix and Interface Management Areas, which are the highest-priority timber production designations..

The Forest Plan offers no explanation for excluding 4,000 acres of Craggy/Big Ivy and placing it in timber production management.

The Forest Plan inexplicably did not analyze the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area, stating: "Recommendation of the Big Ivy area as a National Scenic Area was considered in an alternative but not analyzed in detail in Chapter 2 of the EIS" (Appendix A, pp. 166-167).

In the Record of Decision, the forest plan states:

"Thousands of commenters wrote in support of a National Scenic Area recommendation in the Craggy Mountains/Big Ivy area of the Appalachian Ranger District with the purpose of ensuring protection and preservation of natural resources, scenic quality, and recreation opportunities. The Forest Service recognizes the public interest in protection of this area and included a range of alternatives that respond to the desire for wilderness recommendation and resource protection in the Craggy Mountains area.

"Following the comment period, elements of the National Scenic Area proposal were folded into Alternative E which recommends an expanded area for recommended wilderness and allocates much of the remaining area as a Forest Scenic Area within the Special Interest Area Management Area. The variation in the management area allocation in the range of alternatives adequately addresses the diverse public interests and values in the Craggy Mountains, Big Ivy, Snowball Mountain, and Shope Creek areas by recognizing their ecological diversity, scenic values, and recreational uses" (p. 56).

While it is true that portions of the broader Craggy/Big Ivy area were included in different management areas in different alternatives, some portions were only considered for timber production management, such as Shope Creek and Ox Creek. Furthermore, in the only alternative in which Ivy Knob and Snowball Mountain were considered for anything besides timber production management (Alternative C), the Forest Service provided no analysis of the benefits of more protective management to address the interests expressed by the public. In other words, it appears that the Forest Service considered the protection of Ivy Knob and Snowball Mountain to have no benefits. The County strongly disagrees.

In the Final EIS, the forest plan states:

"Alternative E expands Craggy Mountain Forest Scenic Area from the original area designated in the current plan and identified in other action alternatives. The Forest Scenic Area area was increased from 1,840 acres in other alternatives to 11,501 total acres in Alternative E and renamed to the Big Ivy/Craggy Mountains Forest Scenic Area to reflect that the landscape is larger than the Craggy Mountain alone. Since this Forest Scenic Area incorporates Special Interest Area acres, as well as Research Natural Area and Recommended Wilderness Area acres, the table above reflects 8,224 acres of Special Interest Area with a desired High SIO, 3,222 Recommended Wilderness with a desired Very High SIO, and a 55 acres Research Natural Area with a desired High SIO. In total these 11,501 acres in the Big Ivy/Craggy Mountain Forest Scenic Area will comprise most of the national forest lands visible from the Blue Ridge Parkway at Pinnacle Gap and Craggy Gardens" (3-488).

This description implicitly acknowledges that portions of the Blue Ridge Parkway viewshed are NOT protected at its most popular and most photographed vista. Furthermore, this description makes it painfully clear that the Forest Service did not consider the viewshed from other portions of the Parkway or other important area vantage points.

In Appendix A, the forest plan states:

"Several campaigns and form letters included comments advocating for the Big Ivy area of the Appalachian Ranger District to be recommended for wilderness and a National Scenic Area. Commenters pointed to the area's rich biodiversity, old growth forests, clean waters, connectivity to other protected lands, scenic quality and visibility from the Blue Ridge Parkway and widespread public support for these national designations" (p.166).

The Forest Service provides no discussion anywhere in the ROD, FEIs, or Appendices for how it decided to exclude 4,000 acres of Craggy from Forest Scenic Area protection. It also

provides no explanation for why it placed Snowball, Ivy Knob, Shope Creek, and Ox Creek in its highest priority logging designations.

Only one sentence in the entire 1,500-page document indirectly addresses the exclusion of 4,000 acres of Craggy:

A portion of the Big Ivy area north of SR 197, and the western part of the Snowball Mountain area will be managed as Matrix and Interface MAs, allowing for vegetation management consistent with those MAs" (Appendix A, p. 167).

This is not analysis. A decision based on this conclusory statement would be wholly inadequate, arbitrary, and

capricious.

The remedy is simple, and it already has complete local, public, political, and stakeholder support: Include the entire Craggy/Big Ivy area, including Ivy Knob, Snowball Mountain, Ox Creek, and Shope Creek in the Forest Scenic Area designation.

B. The Forest Service failed to study the Craggy National Scenic Area proposal, the most popular and publicly supported portion of the entire Nantahala Pisgah Forest Plan.

In "Alternatives Considered but Eliminated from Detailed Study," the Forest Plan states:

"An alternative that proposed specific management for the greater Craggy Mountains area including a National Scenic Area recommendation for a 16,000-acre area of the Black Mountain Geographic Area including the Craggy Mountains, Coxcomb Mountain, Snowball Mountain, Shope Creek, and Ox Creek areas. Thousands of commenters wrote in support of a National Scenic Area recommendation in the Craggy Mountains/Big Ivy area of the Appalachian Ranger District with the purpose of ensuring protection and preservation of natural resources, scenic quality and recreation opportunities. The Forest Service recognizes the public interest in protection of this area and included a range of alternatives that respond to the desire for wilderness recommendation and resource protection in the Craggy Mountains area.

"Following the comment period, elements of the National Scenic Area proposal were folded into Alternative E which recommends an expanded area for wilderness and allocates much of the remaining area as a Forest Scenic Area within the Special Interest Area Management Area. The variation in the management area allocation in the range of alternatives adequately addresses the diverse public interests and values in the Craggy Mountains, Big Ivy, Snowball Mountain, and Shope Creek areas by recognizing their ecological diversity, scenic values, and recreational uses" (2-27-28).

This two-paragraph dismissal of the most popular and publicly supported portion of the Nantahala Pisgah Forest Plan is wholly inadequate. The "variation in the range of alternatives" does not at all adequately address the "diverse public interests and values of Craggy. Nowhere in the analysis comparing alternative land allocations for different Alternatives does the Forest Service explain how any alternative would be more or less responsive to public comments or the underlying values they sought to protect. The "public interests and values in the Craggy" section of Pisgah National Forest have been resoundingly clear and united in supporting the Craggy National Scenic Area.

The Craggy National Scenic Area proposal received more public, political, community, business, and stakeholder support than any other component of the Nantahala Pisgah Forest Plan. The U.S. Forest Service received an

unprecedented, record-setting number of comments on the Nantahala Pisgah Forest Plan. Over 22,000 comments were received by the U.S. Forest Service. 92 percent of all comments supported more protected areas in the Nantahala and Pisgah National Forest. They also supported stronger and more permanent protections for the most important recreation and conservation areas in the Nantahala Pisgah National Forest.

Over 10,000 public comments-nearly half of all comments submitted on the Nantahala Pisgah Forest Plan-supported the complete Craggy National Scenic Area.

The Buncombe County Commission has responded to its constituents who have twice filled the commission chambers in support of protecting all of Craggy/Big Ivy. Asheville City Council has also passed a unanimous bipartisan resolution supporting the entire Craggy National Scenic Area. In addition, the Nantahala Pisgah Forest Partnership has endorsed the protection of all of Craggy/Big Ivy as a wilderness and national scenic area. Over 150 local businesses and organizations have also endorsed the entire Craggy National Scenic Area.

Despite this clear mandate from the local community, political leaders, stakeholders and the public, the Forest Service arbitrarily and capriciously decided not to study the Craggy proposal in detail. Instead, it placed over 4,000 acres of Craggy's most important conservation and recreation areas in the Matrix Management Area without any analysis or explanation.

The Forest Service failed to fully analyze the proposal with the most widespread public, community, political, and stakeholder support, and it offered absolutely no concrete explanation or analysis in the Forest Plan for this decision.

REQUEST FOR RELIEF

The Forest Service failed to properly evaluate 4,000 acres of forest in the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area and Craggy/Big Ivy section of Pisgah National Forest in its draft ROD and FEIS. It also failed to include these key conservation and recreation areas in its Forest Scenic Area designation. Accordingly, the Forest Service must amend its plans to include 4,000 acres of Snowball Mountain, North Fork, Shope Creek, and Ox Creek in its Forest Scenic Area. It should also study and recommend the Craggy National Scenic Area with the expanded wilderness area described in that proposal.

Signed this 15th day of March, 2022, on behalf of: The Buncombe County Board of Commissioners

By: -

I-WI, _ _ M_,ew,; _

Brownie Newman, Chair

RESOLUTION #22-03-16

RESOLUTION OBJECTING TO PORTIONS OF THE NANTAHALA AND PISGAH NATIONAL FORESTS
DECISION NOTICE ON A NEW LAND MANAGEMENT PLAN

WHEREAS, the Buncombe County Board of Commissioners previously submitted unanimous bipartisan resolutions supporting the protection of the entire Craggy/Big Ivy area by Resolutions #16-09-02 and #20-04-13;

WHEREAS, Buncombe County supported the protection of the entire Big Ivy area not only because of its incomparable scenic value, but also because of the entire area's importance for protecting water quality, its old-growth forests and other biological values, and its world- class recreational setting and experience;

WHEREAS, this Board finds that the Forest Service decision in this matter failed to consider the impact of its management allocations on Buncombe County; failed to properly analyze as a reasonable alternative the protection of the entire area for its scenic, water, biological, and recreational values; failed to include these key conservation and recreation areas in its Forest Scenic Area designation; and failed to fully consider and analyze the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area with embedded wilderness designation for an expanded Craggy Mountain Wilderness Area; and

WHEREAS, this Board finds that it is the best interests of the citizens and residents of Buncombe County to Object to the Revised Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Board of Commissioners for the County of Buncombe as follows:

1. That the Chair, or his designee, is hereby authorized to execute and file an Objection to the Revised Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision, a copy

of which is included with this agenda item.

2. That the Chair, or his designee, is hereby authorized, empowered and directed to do any and all other acts and to execute any and all other documents, which they, in their discretion, deem necessary and appropriate in order to consummate the transactions contemplated by this Resolution, except that none of the above shall be authorized or empowered to do anything or execute any document which is in contravention, in any way, of the specific provisions of this Resolution.

3. All acts and doings of officers, employees and agents of the County, whether taken prior to, on, or after the date of this Resolution, that are in conformity with and in the furtherance of the purposes and intents of this Resolution as described above shall be, and the same hereby are, in all respects ratified, approved and confirmed.

1. That this resolution shall become effective upon its adoption.

This the 15th day of March, 2022.

ATTEST

BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS FOR THE

COUNTY OF BUNCOMBE

By:

Lamar Joyner, Clerk
FORM

Brownie Newman, Chair APPROVED AS TO

County Attorney

RESOLUTION #22-03-16

RESOLUTION OBJECTING TO PORTIONS OF THE NANTAHALA AND PISGAH NATIONAL FORESTS
DECISION NOTICE ON A NEW LAND MANAGEMENT PLAN

WHEREAS, the Buncombe County Board of Commissioners previously submitted unanimous bipartisan resolutions supporting the protection of the entire Craggy/Big Ivy area by Resolutions #16-09-02 and #20-04-13;

WHEREAS, Buncombe County supported the protection of the entire Big Ivy area not only because of its incomparable scenic value, but also because of the entire area's importance for protecting water quality, its old-growth forests and other biological values, and its world- class recreational setting and experience;

WHEREAS, this Board finds that the Forest Service decision in this matter failed to consider the impact of its management allocations on Buncombe County; failed to properly analyze as a reasonable alternative the protection of the entire area for its scenic, water, biological, and recreational values; failed to include these key conservation and recreation areas in its Forest Scenic Area designation; and failed to fully consider and analyze the proposed Craggy National Scenic Area with embedded wilderness designation for an expanded Craggy Mountain Wilderness Area; and

WHEREAS, this Board finds that it is the best interests of the citizens and residents of Buncombe County to Object to the Revised Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Board of Commissioners for the County of Buncombe as follows:

1. That the Chair, or his designee, is hereby authorized to execute and file an Objection to the Revised Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Plan Final Environmental Impact Statement and Draft Record of Decision, a copy of which is included with this agenda item.
2. That the Chair, or his designee, is hereby authorized, empowered and directed to do any and all other acts and to execute any and all other documents, which they, in their discretion, deem necessary and appropriate in order to consummate the transactions contemplated by this Resolution, except that none of the above shall be authorized or empowered to do anything or execute any document which is in contravention, in any way, of the specific provisions of this Resolution.
3. All acts and doings of officers, employees and agents of the County, whether taken prior to, on, or after the date of this Resolution, that are in conformity with and in the furtherance of the purposes and intents of this Resolution as described above shall be, and the same hereby are, in all respects ratified, approved and confirmed.

1. That this resolution shall become effective upon its adoption.

This the 15th day of March, 2022.

ATTEST

BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS FOR THE

COUNTY OF BUNCOMBE

By:

Lamar Joyner, Clerk
FORM

Brownie Newman, Chair APPROVED AS TO

County Attorney