

Data Submitted (UTC 11): 5/29/2024 9:11:30 PM

First name: chris

Last name: schwarzhoff

Organization:

Title:

Comments: There are two important roads that are not adequately covered in the Draft EFSF RAMP and they should be, Sugar Creek Road and the Red Metal Mine Road. Until recently both of these roads supported recreational activities that are critical to the continued social and economic viability of the Yellow Pine Village. Both roads were physically closed over 6 years ago without following legal procedures. This was covered in detail in our previous comments of 11/6/2021 in Exhibit E & F. Both of these roads were classified as open roads in the 1997 Payette NF Access Management Plan. The 1997 plan has never been replaced by a valid action. Lots more factual info on the legality is available. These 2 roads attracted visitors to the Village much the same way fishing & hunting do only over a longer period of time during the year. Having these 2 recreation alternatives increases the success of other economic based activities such as the Harmonica Festival by encouraging people to come early or stay longer. A more detailed economic analysis of the impact on the Yellow Pine Village of closing/restricting roads for all 3 action alternatives is required given the close tie to the economic survival between the Village & Recreation. The current situation provides a unique analysis opportunity to provide specific economic data on the impacts of closing roads because these 2 roads were locked & gated over 6 years ago. Examples - how many gallons of gas was sold in YP last year versus 6 years ago or how much change in lodging in this period or what change in full time residents & open business or how many visitors for the Harmonica Festival now and 6 years ago. This kind of analysis has real value as compared to that referred to in the Draft EFSF RAMP based totally on generalities.

Sugar Creek Road

This is a highly valued road that was built to access the Cinnabar Mine. Opening this road would benefit the recreation community, provide reasonable access to private property, and at the same time support the economic stability of Yellow Pine which depends on recreation (primarily motorized). The road is designated to be open only in Alternative D, but a detailed Socioeconomic study should likely recommend for economic reasons and reasonable access the road be opened in all 3 of the Action Alternatives. We believe this would be an acceptable correct course of action for the EFSF RAMP. However we do believe the RAMP should also include another option and that is to open the route as a TOV. Because of the high fishery issues of this route the plan should identify any special concerns how a TOV route would be built and managed. For example, if a bridge is required it should be designed to handle possible short term access by special order such as a fire truck for wildfire suppression or possibly a mobile or modular home for the private property. Other special concerns for fisheries could be handled the way Valley County handles them on the EFSF Road a few miles from the Sugar Creek Road (in this case temporary size restrictions of vehicles in the Spring).

Red Metal Mine Road

This road accesses the Red Metal Mine which is the launching site for boon dock hiking (mostly to go fishing) into Crater Lake for recreationists in the Big Creek/Yellow Pine area. Reopening the road is the least impact solution, but if reopening this road is not done, then as discussed in our 11/6/2021 comments, an alternative for access to Crater Lake needs to be considered in this Draft EFSF RAMP. An obvious option would be extending the proposed ATV route past the Wilson Mine listed in Alternative C of the Draft EFSF RAMP to Crater Lake. The Red Metal Mine Road is made to order as a TOV Trail. Pickups and 2 WD cars can easily traverse the route to within a very short distance of the Mine where it crosses a very small creek. To avoid installation of a drainage crossing the road/ trail could be terminated at that point with park and turn around for cars and pickups. Attached is a video of the Red Metal Mine Road that dramatically shows how benign this route is. The video was made a few days after a thunder/rain storm passed through the area. The storm created the wildfire, smoke, and the few puddles that show on the road.

Socioeconomic Analysis

Regarding the Socioeconomic aspects of this plan we believe the decision to include positive actions on the

Quartz Creek roads & trails in all 3 action alternatives should have highlighted the Social value of this decision to the Village of Yellow Pine. Yellow Pine is a relatively small property that is 100% surrounded by National Forest. The Quartz Creek area is pretty, but does not contain specific highlights like Cinnabar or Crater Lake that attract outside visitors. The proposed access (right up next to the Village limits) will definitely improve Social opportunities for residents in Yellow Pine, and of course provide some recreational opportunity (nothing like the Sugar Creek & Red Metal Mine Roads), while simultaneously providing access to mining claims. However we believe the biggest Social improvement would result from a combination of actions from the 3 alternatives. Specifically we propose doing the 1.31 lower miles of Quartz Road as a TOV from Alternatives B&C plus the 5.14 miles of UTV trail in Alternative D.

A more meaningful Socioeconomic Analysis would be easier to complete if the invalid 2007 travel plan Settlement Agreement sections 7b, & 7c were fully accomplished.