

Data Submitted (UTC 11): 2/21/2023 3:03:09 AM

First name: George Mathias

Last name: Kondolf

Organization:

Title:

Comments: I am a fluvial geomorphologist with experience dealing with disturbed, unstable landscapes and sediment delivery to river systems in North and Central America. With graduate students, I spent time on the site in 2021, collecting topographic data, establishing photo stations, and surveying a channel that was positioned to receive sediment eroded from the construction site. I certainly agree that the site was badly disturbed by the construction of the border wall. I agree that it would be desirable to restore natural topography and drainage, but given the severity of the impact, restoration to pre-disturbance conditions is not possible. To attempt such a large-scale restoration would be a massive and very expensive project, which in the end would be only partially successful at best. As I interpret the document and diagrams, what is proposed is essentially a set of 'bandaids' that would be put on eroding sites to reduce the rate of erosion locally, but there will remain the potential of large failures, including massive failure of the mountain of sediment, which resembles a large 'tailings pile'.

The text does not give many details of what is proposed, and there is no detailed map showing where the structures are proposed to go, etc. I can understand why the agency staff would prefer to adapt to conditions in the field. However, this is such a massive, unstable pile of sediment that I fear it will overwhelm some of their control attempts, at least during a big storm. Some of the structures proposed appear better suited to lower gradient situations. Their stability at this site is questionable, and they are likely prone to be eroded or buried in sediment. The slopes here are very steep indeed.

I would recommend that this effort be undertaken in an adaptive management framework, understanding that there are many uncertainties, and the success of the project is far from a sure thing, but at least it can provide learning experiences to inform future restoration efforts.

G Mathias Kondolf, PhD

Professor of Environmental Planning and Geography

University of California Berkeley