

Data Submitted (UTC 11): 3/14/2020 7:00:00 AM

First name: Earl

Last name: Christian

Organization: NA

Title:

Comments: What monitoring protocols will be used to measure the effect of grazing horses? Confinement of horses most likely would result in grave damage to rangelands. Will there be enough watering locations to keep them spread out?

What water will be provided to the horse herd and at what cost? I read that horses need from 5 to 10 gallons of water per day. The Forest needs to calculate the availability of water quantity. Who will be responsible for the maintenance of water sources? If the permittee is not monitoring the stock tanks or trick tanks who is responsible? You might remember the Clifton District killed a couple of horses a few years back because they did not check on the water availability.

What is the actual capacity? Adaptive management doesn't address the actual forage at this time that has been established for the horses in terms of AUMs? Elk would be seasonal but the horses would be year round. What about the number of animal units used by elk in combination with the horses? If a designated number of horses is specified in this management plan how will the herd be managed to maintain this number? Also what will be done if range trends are going downhill, will the numbers be reduced?

What negative economic effects will the affected grazing permittees suffer by the reduction in their annual grazing plans and permits because of this horse area management designation? In other words what would be the reduction of their potential income because of this designation?

The Forest Service needs to calculate a benefit cost analysis for this management plan. Actually I can't think of any benefit other than horse lovers will know that they are still out there.

What effect will the horses have on the forage available to rodents and the subsequent effect to predators such as hawks and the northern Goshawk?

What is being done to prevent these horses from migrating to other areas of the Forest? What fencing will be needed to keep the horses in the management area?

These horses came from the Fort Apache Reservation, so why not drive them back where they came from and fix the fences. Let the Ft. Apache be the wild horse area. This at least should be one of the alternatives considered. It is the least cost and highest benefit to everyone.

Oh, my gosh, tanks, fences, helicopters, round ups. How much is this going to cost on an annual basis? Another thing, if we are treating the horses like livestock by providing additional water etc. Then are they wild? Or just barely managed livestock?