1 2	BEFORE THE BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY STATE OF IDAHO
3	
4	
	IN THE MATTER OF AIR QUALITY)
5	PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT P-2019.0047) Agency Case No.
) 0101-22-01
6	NEZ PERCE TRIBE, IDAHO)
	CONSERVATION LEAGUE, and SAVE THE)
7	SOUTHFORK SALMON,) OAH Case No.
	Petitioners,) 23-245-01
8	vs.)
)
9	IDAHO DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL)
1.0	QUALITY,)
10	Respondent,)
1 1	and)
11	
10	PERPETUA RESOURCES IDAHO, INC.,)
12	Intervenor-Respondent.)
13)
14	
15	
16	
17	SPECIAL MEETING
18	MAY 1, 2024
19	BOISE, IDAHO
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	REPORTED BY: DORIS M. BAILEY, CSR, RPR, CRR
	Idaho CSR License Number SRL-1074
	Page 1

Veritext Legal Solutions Calendar-Idaho@veritext.com 208-343-4004

1 A P P E A R A N C E S 2	1 PROCEEDINGS
BOARD MEMBERS:	2000
3 MIKE BOWEN, Chair	3 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: It's Monday, May 1st, 2024,
4	4 9:00 AM. This is Mark Bowen, Chairman of the Idaho Board
BETH ELROY	5 of Environmental Quality.
5 JOHN R. MACMILLAN, Vice Chair (Remote)	6 I call to order this special meeting of the
6	7 Idaho Board of Environmental Quality. In addition to
JOHN SIGLER (Remote) 7	8 being a public meeting, we are also on the record on the
CLAYTON STEELE (Remote)	9 matter of Air Quality Permit to Construct Issued to
8 PAT PURDY (Remote)	10 Perpetua Resources Idaho, Inc., agency case number
9	11 0101-22-01, OAH case number 23-245-01.
10 ALSO PRESENT: 11 ANN YRIBAR, ESQ.	12 This special meeting is being held in the state
Deputy Attorney General	13 office of the Department of Environmental Quality.
	14 For those present in the meeting room, please
ELAINE GANINO 13 Board Clerk	15 sign in on the sheet provided at the entrance.16 There won't be an opportunity for public comment
14 PAULA WILSON	16 There won't be an opportunity for public comment17 today.
Board Coordinator 15	17 totay. 18 Elaine, could you please take roll?
16oOo	 BOARD CLERK GANINO: Yes, Mr. Chairman.
17 18	20 Mark Bowen.
19	21 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Here.
20 21	22 BOARD CLERK GANINO: Dr. Randy MacMillan.
22	23 Randy? He's there, I see him there. Randy?
23 24	24 He's not responding. I'll go back and try him again.
25	25 Beth Elroy.
Pag	ge 2 Page 4
1 INDEX	1 BOARD MEMBER ELROY: Here.
2 Page 3	2 BOARD CLERK GANINO: John Sigler.
Proceedings 4	3 BOARD MEMBER SIGLER: Here.
Agenda Item Number 1	4 BOARD CLERK GANINO: Clayton Steele.
5 Motion 6	5 He's online also.
6 Viete 6	6 BOARD MEMBER STEELE: Here.
Vote 6 7	7 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: There we go.
Executive Session 7 8	8 BOARD CLERK GANINO: Pat Purdy.
Motion 7	9 BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Here.
9 Vote 8	10 BOARD CLERK GANINO: We'll go back to Randy
10 Agenda Item Number 2	11 MacMillan.
11	12 VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: Here.
Motion 9 12	13BOARD MEMBER BOWEN: There we go.
Discussion 10 13	14 VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: I'm here.
Vote 18	15 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: We got you, Randy. Thanks.
14 Closing 18	16 VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: All right.
15	17 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: And Carol's not joining us;
Motion 18 16	18 correct? 19 BOARD CLERK GANINO: Correct.
Vote 19 17	
18oOo	20 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Okay. All right. So the 21 Board
19 20	 21 Board 22 BOARD MEMBER STEELE: Clayton Steele here.
21	23 BOARD MEMBER STEELE. Clayton Steele here. 23 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Clayton, we've got
22 23	23 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Clayton, we ve got 24 everybody. Thank you.
24 25	24 everybody. Thank you. 25 BOARD MEMBER STEELE: Okay. Thanks.
	ge 3 Page 5

2 (Pages 2 - 5)

Veritext Legal Solutions Calendar-Idaho@veritext.com 208-343-4004

1			
1	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The Board intends to take	1	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Do we have a second?
2	action at this meeting. No additional statements or oral	2	BOARD MEMBER STEELE: Second.
3	argument will be taken at this meeting. A court reporter	3	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: We have a motion and a
4	is present to record the Board's discussion.	4	second. All in favor? I guess we'll take a roll call
5	We will now move on to the agenda items. Agenda	5	vote.
6	number 1 is the option for the Board to go into executive	6	Elaine, will you take a roll call, please?
7	session. I will entertain a motion.	7	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Yes, Mr. Chairman.
8	BOARD MEMBER ELROY: I move the Board enter into	8	Mark Bowen.
9	executive session pursuant to IC 74-206(1)(f) to	9	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Aye.
	communicate with legal counsel for the public agency to	10	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Dr. Randy MacMillan.
11	discuss the legal ramifications of and legal options for	11	VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: Aye.
	pending litigation, or controversies not yet being	12	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Beth Elroy.
	litigated but imminently likely to be litigated.	13	BOARD MEMBER ELROY: Aye.
14	I request that a roll call vote be taken and	14	BOARD CLERK GANINO: John Sigler.
15	that vote be recorded in the minutes of this meeting.	15	BOARD MEMBER SIGLER: Aye.
16	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: We have a motion. Is there	16	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Clayton Steele.
17	a second?	17	BOARD MEMBER STEELE: Aye.
18	VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: Second.	18	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Pat Purdy.
19	(Reporter clarification.)	19	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye.
20	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Randy, Dr. MacMillan.	20	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Motion carries. So we a
21	We have a motion and a second. We'll now call a	21	back on the record after executive session.
	roll vote.	22	We're now on agenda item number 2, Amended
23	Elaine.		Petition for Review of Preliminary Orders Filed in the
24	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Yes, Mr. Chairman.		Matter of Air Quality Permit to Consent Construct
25	Mark Bowen.		Issued to Perpetua Resources Idaho, Inc., Agency Case
-	Page 6		Page 8
1	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Aye.	1	number 0101-22-01, OAH case number 23-245.
2	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Dr. Randy MacMillan.	2	This is an action item to discuss and adopt a
3	VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: Aye.	3	final order prior to service of a written order within 56
4	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Beth Elroy.	4	days of the March 14th, 2024 oral argument.
5	BOARD MEMBER ELROY: Aye.	5	I'll entertain a motion.
6	BOARD CLERK GANINO: John Sigler.	6	BOARD MEMBER ELROY: I move based on the
7	BOARD MEMBER SIGLER: Aye.	7	foregoing, the DEQ Board finds:
8	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Clayton Steele.	8	Number one. DEQ acted responsibly in
9	He's online also.	9	determining that Perpetua will have legal control of the
10	BOARD MEMBER STEELE: Aye.	10	Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be
	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: There we go.	11	excluded from consideration as ambient air.
11	DOADD CLEDK CANINO, Dot Durdy	12	Number 2. DEQ acted responsibly in determining
	BOARD CLERK GANINO: Pat Purdy.	12	
12	BOARD CLEEK GANINO: Par Purdy. BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye.		that Perpetua what will have physical and practical
12 13	-	13	
12 13 14	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye.	13 14	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical
12 13 14 15	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session.	13 14 15	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it
12 13 14 15 16	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session.	13 14 15	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as
12 13 14 15 16 17	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you.	13 14 15 16 17	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by
12 13 14 15 16 17 18	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.)	13 14 15 16 17 18	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.) BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: All right. I'll entertain a	13 14 15 16 17 18	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by allowing Perpetua to submit some plans after the PTC was
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.) BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: All right. I'll entertain a motion.	13 14 15 16 17 18 19	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by allowing Perpetua to submit some plans after the PTC was issued. Number 4. The PTC includes enforceable
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.) BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: All right. I'll entertain a motion. BOARD MEMBER ELROY: I move that the Board	13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by allowing Perpetua to submit some plans after the PTC was issued. Number 4. The PTC includes enforceable
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.) BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: All right. I'll entertain a motion. BOARD MEMBER ELROY: I move that the Board resolve out of executive session and that the meeting of	 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by allowing Perpetua to submit some plans after the PTC was issued. Number 4. The PTC includes enforceable conditions that will achieve 93.3 percent dust control.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.) BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: All right. I'll entertain a motion. BOARD MEMBER ELROY: I move that the Board resolve out of executive session and that the meeting of the minutes reflect that no action was taken during the	13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by allowing Perpetua to submit some plans after the PTC was issued. Number 4. The PTC includes enforceable conditions that will achieve 93.3 percent dust control. Number 5. There was insufficient evidence to
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Aye. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: The motion has carried. We will now move to executive session. Thank you. (Thereupon there was a brief recess.) BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: All right. I'll entertain a motion. BOARD MEMBER ELROY: I move that the Board resolve out of executive session and that the meeting of the minutes reflect that no action was taken during the executive session.	13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	that Perpetua what will have physical and practical control of the Stibnite Road access route such that it could properly be excluded from the consideration as ambient air. Number 3. DEQ did not violate the air rules by allowing Perpetua to submit some plans after the PTC was issued. Number 4. The PTC includes enforceable conditions that will achieve 93.3 percent dust control. Number 5. There was insufficient evidence to support DEQ's evaluation of the ambient air

3 (Pages 6 - 9)

1 hearing officer for further factual development in	1	became well versed in numerous aspects of cancer biology,
2 accordance with the terms of this order.	2	including how cancer is initiated, how it how cancer
3 We further direct our legal counsel to draft a	3	is promoted, and how it progresses.
4 final order in accordance with the terms of our decision,	4	The biological processes associated with cancer
5 and to serve it on the parties by Thursday, May 9th.	5	are the same whether the cancer occurs in humans, other
6 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: We have a motion. Do w	ve 6 1	mammals, fish, or mollusks.
7 have a second?	7	The AACCs that we see in Section 586 of our air
8 BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Second by Pat Purdy.	8	quality rules are air emission concentration limits
9 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: We have a motion and a	9	exclusively intended to minimize the risk of starting
10 second. We will now have a general discussion. I'd open	10	cancer. Cancer starts when a carcinogen such as arsenic
11 it to Board members to discuss any of the items, 1	11 1	is inhaled and causes mutation in cellular DNA. That
12 through 5.	12	mutation is inheritable, meaning it is passed from the
13 MS. YRIBAR: You want to just call on people?	13	mutate cell to daughter cells.
14 BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yeah, let's start.	14	Also, depending on various physiological
15 Dr. MacMillan, I'll start with you.	15	variables, cancer can quickly or slowly lead to
16 VICE CHAIR MACMILLAN: Mr. Chairman, I do no	ot16	uncontrolled, neoplastic cell growth that is cancerous
17 believe DEQ's creation and application of a	17	cell growth, and development of a tumor grossly
18 project-specific adjustment factor can be supported by	18	recognized as cancer.
19 Idaho's air quality rules. I believe DEQ has	19	One of the challenges of cancer as a human
20 misinterpreted how the acceptable ambient concentration	20	disease is that it is not readily recognized in its early
21 for carcinogens, the AACC, must be applied if it is to	21	stages. This should not be surprising when you consider
22 comply with our air quality rules.	22	that humans contain 10 to 100 trillion cells.
Further, and most disturbing to me, is that the	23	Often it is only after considerable growth that
24 creation of a project-specific adjustment factor suggests	24	a grossly or histologically recognizable cancer becomes
25 that there is a significant ignorance about cancer,	25	evident. Sometimes it's not detected until a person
Page 10		Page 12
1 carcinogens, and carcinogenosis.	1	feels ill, seeks medical attention, or dies.
2 While DEQ experts correctly identified the AACC	2	To reiterate, once cancer is initiated,
3 as the gold standard for minimizing cancer risk, they	3	neoplastic, uncontrolled cellular replication may occur
4 failed to recognize that the ACC the AACC		relatively quickly, or it may take many years, perhaps
5 fundamentally functions to limit the initiation of	5	more than 70 years for detection of a recognizable
6 cancer, not only after 70 years, but every day of a	6	cancer.
7 person's life, starting at birth.	7	The take-home message is the cancer starts well
8 By applying the, what I would call short-sighted		
9 project-specific adjustment factor to the Stibnite Gold	8	before it is recognized. You don't need 70 years for it
		before it is recognized. You don't need 70 years for it to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the
10 Project, DEQ created a misleading risk analysis that	9	
10 Project, DEQ created a misleading risk analysis that11 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk.	9 10	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the
	9 10	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as
11 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk.	9 10 11 12	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors.
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like 	9 10 11 12 13	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. 	9 10 11 12 13	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles,
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic.
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 ne 17	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, the 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 ne 17	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, th Board should know that I have received considerable 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 16 16 17 18 19	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the development.
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, th Board should know that I have received considerable graduate education, was a senior research fellow 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the development. But most germane in this contested case are
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, th Board should know that I have received considerable graduate education, was a senior research fellow conducting post-doctoral research, and spent considerable 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the development. But most germane in this contested case are carcinogen dose and duration. The greater the dose of
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, th Board should know that I have received considerable graduate education, was a senior research fellow conducting post-doctoral research, and spent considerable part of my career as a research comparative pathologist. 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the development. But most germane in this contested case are carcinogen dose and duration. The greater the dose of carcinogen exposure, the greater is the chance of cancer
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, th Board should know that I have received considerable graduate education, was a senior research fellow conducting post-doctoral research, and spent considerable part of my career as a research comparative pathologist. Prior to entering a private enterprise here in Idaho, I 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the development. But most germane in this contested case are carcinogen dose and duration. The greater the dose of carcinogen exposure, the greater is the chance of cancer initiation; the longer the duration of carcinogen
 greatly underestimates the actual cancer risk. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to explain further. BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Go ahead, Dr. MacMillan. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: Mr. Chairman? BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Yes, go ahead. BOARD MEMBER MCMAHON: By way of background, th Board should know that I have received considerable graduate education, was a senior research fellow conducting post-doctoral research, and spent considerable part of my career as a research comparative pathologist. Prior to entering a private enterprise here in Idaho, I was a professor of veterinary and aquatic animal 	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	to appear. There are multiple variables that impact the initiation, promotion, and progression of cancer, such as age, immune status, comorbidities, and co-factors. The co-factor with the Stibnite Gold Project would be dust, particularly pm 2.5 or smaller particles, all of which contain arsenic. Inhaled dust can linger for extended periods in our lungs. Such dust is associated with a variety of pathologic processes that can amplify or enhance the development. But most germane in this contested case are carcinogen dose and duration. The greater the dose of carcinogen exposure, the greater is the chance of cancer initiation; the longer the duration of carcinogen exposure, the greater is the risk of developing cancer.

4 (Pages 10 - 13)

Veritext Legal Solutions Calendar-Idaho@veritext.com 208-343-4004

1	limit cancer to only a one in one million chance.	1	new cancer risks.
2	The higher dose, such as associated with this	2	Thank you.
3	short-term project in a T-RACT acceptable concentrations,	3	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Thank you, Dr. MacMillan.
4	would be expected to limit cancer to one in 100,000	4	Ms. Elroy, any comments?
5	chances, even after 70 years.	5	BOARD MEMBER ELROY: Yes. Dr. MacMillan very
6	DEQ concluded that the Stibnite gold project	6 eloquently expressed my opinion as well.	
7	cancer risk exceeds the AACC associated risk and exceeds	7	I will share with all of the parties of this
8	the T-RACT associated risk.	8	case that the Board has extensive technical knowledge and
9	The Idaho rules are not ambiguous. There is an		experience associated with, as Randy explained, as well
10	acceptable risk associated with the AACC standard. There		as decades of air permitting experience on this Board.
	is an an acceptable risk associated with DEQ-approved		So we do feel like due to the Board's expertise, it
	T-RACT projects, and there is an acceptable risk		greatly helped us navigate through a very challenging
	associated with the short-term project that is five years		contested case.
	or less. There are no other acceptable risks identified	14	
	in Idaho's air quality rules.		received by the Deputy Attorney General Ann Yribar. Her
16	DEQ's project-specific adjustment factor creates		legal expertise absolutely helped us also navigate
	a new, higher level of cancer risk for 16 years. DEQ		through this case, and I do want to just say thank you to
	assumes 70 years is required for cancer to develop. That		Ann and recognize her for her expertise and support in
	is an incorrect assumption.		navigating us through this case.
$\begin{vmatrix} 1 \\ 20 \end{vmatrix}$	The AACC, the T-RACT, and short-term AACC	20	
	emission exposure limits are actually daily limits that	21	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Thank you.
	apply over a person's entire lifetime, regardless of how	21	-
	long they live. The acceptable cancer risk remains one	23	
	in one million or one in 100,000. Higher carcinogen	23	I concur with Dr. MacMillan's summary and added
	doses increase the cancer risk every day of a person's		comments. I think that very adequately and accurately
25	Page 14		Page 16
1	life. A higher daily dose for 16 years elevates the	1	puts forward not only the review that's been done by the
2	cancer risk even more.	2	Board, but technical experts and the legal staff, that
3	Application of the project-specific adjustment	3	going forward we will have a solid foundation for
4	factor allows DEQ to ignore 16 years of higher cancer	4	providing the instructions that we're going to do here
5	initiation risk. The PTC proposes to allow 16 years	5	shortly.
6	higher daily carcinogen doses, and disguises such doses	6	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Thank you.
7	using a non-rules-based mathematics. Use of the	7	BOARD MEMBER SIGLER: That's all.
8	project-specific adjustment factor ignores 16 years of	8	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Thank you.
9	cancer initiation due to higher carcinogenic arsenic dose	9	Mr. Steele, any comments?
10	that is otherwise allowed by rule. The AACC, the T-RACT,	10	BOARD MEMBER STEELE: No, I do not have any
	and short-term project AACCs dictate an annual average		comments.
	compliance.	12	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Thank you.
13	DEQ further violates this compliance point by	13	
14	instituting a five-year rolling average compliance. Such	14	BOARD MEMBER PURDY: Sorry. Trying to find the
	a creative compliance point allows even further departure	15	unmute button.
	from our air quality goals, and specifically compliance	16	No, I do not have any comments. Thank you.
	with Section 161 of our air quality rules.	17	BOARD CHAIR BOWEN: Thank you. I'd just like to
18	And personally it grieves me to disagree with	18	add a general discussion to just
	DEQ. I regard DEQ staff as a team of environmental	19	The Board would like to acknowledge the effort
	heroes. They have a daunting task to protect our		of all participants. There's been a tremendous amount of
	environment and, in particular, help the people, animals,		work on everybody's behalf on this. We understand how
22	and plants, while fostering financial success. But even		complicated and how much work has gone into this. We
	heroes make mistakes.		want to express gratitude for everybody's participation.
24	In my opinion, DEQ has misapplied the Idaho air		I think everybody here is interested in the safety and
25	quality rule, and they do not have authority to create		health of the citizens of Idaho.
	Page 15		Page 17

5 (Pages 14 - 17)

6 (Pages 18 - 20)

[0101-22-01 - applied]

0	3	ability 20:9,12	agency 1:5 4:10
0101-22-01 1:5	3 9:17	absolutely	6:10 8:25
4:11 9:1		16:16	agenda 3:4,10
	4	acc 11:4	6:5,5 8:22
1	4 3:3 9:20	acceptable	18:22
1 1:18 3:4 6:6,9	5	10:20 14:3,10	ahead 11:14,16
10:11	5 9:22 10:12	14:11,12,14,23	air 1:4 4:9 8:24
10 3:12 12:22	56 9:3	access 9:10,14	9:11,16,17,23
100 12:22	586 12:7	accordance	10:19,22 12:7
100,000 14:4,24	6	10:2,4	12:8 14:15
1074 1:25 20:6		accurately	15:16,17,24
20:21	6 3:5,6	16:25	16:10
11:35 19:9	7	achieve 9:21	allow 15:5
12 20:24	7 3:7,8	acknowledge	allowed 15:10
14th 9:4	70 11:6 13:5,8	17:19 18:1	allowing 9:18
16 14:17 15:1,4	13:25 14:5,18	acted 9:8,12	allows 15:4,15
15:5,8	74-206 6:9	action 6:2 7:22	ambient 9:11
161 15:17	8	9:2 20:16	9:16,23 10:20
18 3:13,14,15	8 3:9	actual 11:11	ambiguous
19 3:16	83701-2636	actually 14:21	14:9
1st 4:3	20:22	ada 20:4	amended 8:22
2	9	add 17:18	amount 17:20
2 3:10 8:22		added 16:24	amplify 13:17
9:12	9 3:11	addition 4:7	analysis 11:10
2.5 13:13	93.3 9:21	additional 6:2	animal 11:23
2019.0047 1:5	9:00 4:4	adequately	animals 15:21
2024 1:18 4:3	9th 10:5 20:18	16:25	ann 2:11 16:15
9:4 20:18	a	adjourn 18:23	16:18
2028 20:24	a.m. 19:9	adjourned 19:8	annual 15:11
23-245 9:1	aacc 10:21 11:2	adjustment	appear 13:9
23-245-01 1:7	11:4 13:24	10:18,24 11:9	application
4:11	14:7,10,20,20	14:16 15:3,8	10:17 15:3
2636 20:22	15:10	adopt 9:2	applied 10:21
29419 20:20	aaccs 12:7	age 13:11	13:25
	15:11		

[apply - chair]

apply 14:22	background	17:17,19 18:6	13:10,21,23
applying 11:8	11:17	18:8,9,10,12,13	14:1,4,7,17,18
approved	bailey 1:25	18:14,15,16,17	14:23,25 15:2
14:11	20:6,20	18:18,19,20,21	15:4,9 16:1
aquatic 11:23	based 9:6 15:7	18:24,25 19:1	cancerous
argument 6:3	behalf 17:21	19:2,5,7	12:16
9:4	believe 10:17	board's 6:4	carcinogen
arsenic 12:10	10:19	16:11	12:10 13:20,21
13:14 15:9	best 20:9,11	boise 1:19	13:22 14:24
aspects 12:1	beth 2:4 4:25	20:22	15:6
assistance 18:3	7:4 8:12 18:13	bowen 2:3 4:3	carcinogenic
associated 12:4	biological 12:4	4:4,20,21 5:7	15:9
13:16 14:2,7,8	biology 12:1	5:13,15,17,20	carcinogenosis
14:10,11,13	birth 11:7	5:23 6:1,16,20	11:1
16:9	board 1:1 2:2	6:25 7:1,11,14	carcinogens
assumes 14:18	2:13,14 4:3,4,7	7:18,24 8:1,3,8	10:21 11:1
assumption	4:19,21,22 5:1	8:9,20 10:6,9	career 11:21
14:19	5:2,3,4,6,7,8,9	10:14 11:14,16	carol's 5:17
attention 13:1	5:10,13,15,17	16:3,21 17:6,8	carried 7:14
attorney 2:11	5:19,20,21,22	17:12,17 18:7	18:21
16:15 18:2	5:23,25 6:1,1,6	18:8,10,12,21	carries 8:20
20:14	6:8,8,16,20,24	18:25 19:2,5,7	case 1:5,7 4:10
authority 15:25	7:1,2,4,5,6,7,8	box 20:22	4:11 8:25 9:1
average 15:11	7:10,11,12,13	brief 7:17	13:19 16:8,13
15:14	7:14,18,20,20	button 17:15	16:17,19
aye 7:1,3,5,7,10	7:24 8:1,2,3,7,9	c	causes 12:11
7:13 8:9,11,13	8:10,12,13,14	c 2:1 4:1	cell 12:13,16,17
8:15,17,19	8:15,16,17,18	call 4:6 6:14,21	cells 12:13,22
18:8,11,14,16	8:19,20 9:6,7	8:4,6 10:13	cellular 12:11
18:18,20 19:3	9:25 10:6,8,9	11:8 16:14	13:3
ayes 19:4	10:11,14 11:14	cancer 10:25	certificate 20:1
b	11:15,16,17,18	11:3,6,11 12:1	certified 20:1,7
back 4:24 5:10	16:3,5,8,10,21	12:2,2,4,5,10	certify 20:7,15
8:21	16:23 17:2,6,7	12:10,15,18,19	chair 2:3,5 4:3
	17:8,10,12,14	12:24 13:2,6,7	4:21 5:7,12,14

Page 2

[chair - development]

5:15,16,17,20	closing 3:14	consider 12:21	4
5:23 6:1,16,18	comment 4:16	considerable	d
6:20 7:1,3,11	17:13	11:18,20 12:23	d 3:1 4:1
7:14,18,24 8:1	comments 16:4	consideration	daily 13:25
8:3,9,11,20	16:22,25 17:9	9:11,15	14:21 15:1,6
10:6,9,14,16	17:11,16	construct 1:5	daughter 12:13
11:14,16 16:3	commission	4:9 8:24	daunting 15:20
16:21 17:6,8	20:24	contain 12:22	day 11:6 14:25
17:12,17 18:8	communicate	13:14	20:18
18:10,11,12,21	6:10	contested 13:19	days 9:4
18:25 19:2,5,7	comorbidities	16:13	decades 16:10
chairman 4:4	13:11	control 9:9,14	decision 10:4
4:19 6:24 8:7	comparative	9:21	department 1:9
10:16 11:12,15	11:21	controversies	4:13
18:6	compliance	6:12	departure
challenges	15:12,13,14,15	coordinator	15:15
12:19	15:16	2:14	depending
challenging	complicated	correct 5:18,19	12:14
16:12	17:22	20:10	deputy 2:11
chance 13:21	comply 10:22	correctly 11:2	16:15
14:1	concentration	counsel 6:10	deq 9:7,8,12,17 9:25 10:19
chances 14:5	9:24 10:20	10:3	11:2,10 14:6
citizens 17:25	12:8	county 20:4	14:11,17 15:4
clarification	concentrations	court 6:3	15:13,19,19,24
6:19	14:3	create 15:25	deq's 9:23
clayton 2:7 5:4	concluded 14:6	created 11:10	10:17 14:16
5:22,23 7:8,25	19:9	creates 14:16	detected 12:25
8:16 18:17	concur 16:24	creation 10:17	detection 13:5
clerk 2:13 4:19	conditions 9:21	10:24	determining
4:22 5:2,4,8,10	conducting	creative 15:15	9:9,12
5:19 6:24 7:2,4	11:20	crr 1:25 20:21	develop 14:18
7:6,8,12 8:7,10	consent 8:24	csr 1:25,25	developing
8:12,14,16,18	conservation	20:6,21	13:23
18:6,9,13,15,17	1:6		development
18:19			10:1 12:17

[development - further]

[I		
13:18	e	15:19	f
dictate 15:11	e 2:1,1 3:1 4:1,1	esq 2:11	f 6:9
dies 13:1	early 12:20	evaluation 9:23	factor 10:18,24
direct 10:3	education	everybody 5:24	11:9 13:12
direction 20:9	11:19	17:24	14:16 15:4,8
disagree 15:18	effort 17:19	everybody's	factors 13:11
discuss 6:11	elaine 2:12 4:18	17:21,23	factual 10:1
9:2 10:11	6:23 8:6 18:5	evidence 9:22	failed 11:4
discussion 3:12	elevates 15:1	evident 12:25	favor 8:4 19:3
6:4 10:10		exceeds 14:7,7	
17:13,18	eloquently 16:6	excluded 9:11	feel 16:11
disease 12:20	elroy 2:4 4:25	9:15	feels 13:1
disguises 15:6	5:1 6:8 7:4,5	exclusively	fellow 11:19
disturbing	7:20 8:12,13	12:9	filed 8:23
10:23	9:6 16:4,5	executive 3:7	final 9:3 10:4
dna 12:11	18:13,14,24	6:6,9 7:15,21	financial 15:22
doctoral 11:20	embodied	7:23 8:21	financially
doris 1:25 20:6	13:24	expected 13:25	20:15
20:20	emission 12:8	14:4	find 17:14
dose 13:20,20	14:21	experience 16:9	finds 9:7
13:24 14:2	employee 20:13	16:10	fish 12:6
15:1,9	enforceable	expertise 16:11	five 14:13
doses 14:25	9:20	16:16,18	15:14
	enhance 13:17		foregoing 9:7
15:6,6 dr 4:22 6:20	enter 6:8	experts 11:2 17:2	20:10
	entering 11:22		forward 17:1,3
7:2 8:10 10:15	enterprise	expires 20:24	fostering 15:22
11:14 16:3,5	11:22	explain 11:13	foundation
16:24 18:9	entertain 6:7	explained 16:9	17:3
draft 10:3	7:18 9:5 18:23	exposure 13:21	functions 11:5
due 15:9 16:11	entire 14:22	13:23,24 14:21	fundamentally
duration 13:20	entrance 4:15	express 17:23	11:5
13:22	environment	expressed 16:6	further 10:1,3
dust 9:21 13:13	15:21	extended 13:15	10:23 11:13
13:15,16	environmental	extensive 16:8	15:13,15 20:15
	1:1,9 4:5,7,13		,

[g - low]

a	h	ignores 15:8	;
g		imminently	j
g 4:1	hand 20:17	6:13	john 2:5,6 5:2
ganino 2:12	health 17:25	immune 13:11	7:6 8:14 16:23
4:19,22 5:2,4,8	hearing 10:1	impact 13:9	18:15 19:1
5:10,19 6:24	19:7	includes 9:20	joining 5:17
7:2,4,6,8,12 8:7	held 4:12		june 20:24
8:10,12,14,16	help 15:21	including 12:2 incorrect 14:19	k
8:18 18:6,9,13	helped 16:12	increase 14:25	know 11:18
18:15,17,19	16:16		knowledge
general 2:11	heroes 15:20,23	inhaled 12:11	16:8
10:10 16:15	higher 14:2,17	13:15	l
17:18 18:2	14:24 15:1,4,6	inheritable	
germane 13:19	15:9	12:12	lead 12:15
go 4:24 5:7,10	histologically	initiated 12:2	league 1:6
5:13 6:6 7:11	12:24	13:2	legal 6:10,11,11
11:14,16	home 13:7	initiation 11:5	9:9 10:3 16:14
goals 15:16	human 12:19	13:10,22 15:5	16:16 17:2
going 17:3,4	humans 12:5	15:9	level 14:17
gold 11:3,9	12:22	instituting	license 1:25
13:12 14:6	i	15:14	life 11:7 15:1
graduate 11:19	ic 6:9	instructions	lifetime 14:22
gratitude 17:23		17:4	likely 6:13
greater 13:20	idaho 1:2,6,9 1:11,19,25 4:4	insufficient	limit 11:5 14:1
13:21,23	, ,	9:22	14:4
greatly 11:11	4:7,10 8:25	intended 12:9	limits 12:8
16:12	11:22 14:9	intends 6:1	14:21,21
grieves 15:18	15:24 17:25	interested	linger 13:15
grossly 12:17	20:3,22	17:24 20:16	litigated 6:13
12:24	idaho's 10:19	intervenor 1:12	6:13
growth 12:16	14:15	issued 4:9 8:25	litigation 6:12
12:17,23	identified 11:2	9:19	live 14:23
guess 8:4	14:14	item 3:4,10	long 14:23
0	ignorance	8:22 9:2	longer 13:22
	10:25	items 6:5 10:11	low 13:24
	ignore 15:4		

[lungs - pat]

lungs 13:16	16:5,23 17:7	mutate 12:13	000 2:16 3:18
m	17:10,14 18:14	mutation 12:11	4:2
m 1:25 20:6,20	18:16,18,20,24	12:12	open 10:10
macmillan 2:5	19:1	n	opinion 15:24
4:22 5:11,12	members 2:2	n 2:1 3:1 4:1	16:6
5:14,16 6:18	10:11	navigate 16:12	opportunity
6:20 7:2,3 8:10	message 13:7	16:16	4:16
8:11 10:15,16	mike 2:3	navigating	opposed 19:5
11:14 16:3,5	million 14:1,24	16:19	option 6:6
18:9,11	minimize 12:9	need 13:8 18:10	options 6:11
macmillan's	minimizing	neoplastic	oral 6:2 9:4
16:24	11:3	12:16 13:3	order 4:6 9:3,3
make 15:23	minutes 6:15	new 14:17 16:1	10:2,4
mammals 12:6	7:22	new 14.17 10.1 nez 1:6	orders 8:23
march 9:4	misapplied	non 15:7	р
mark 4:4,20	15:24	notary 20:21	p 1:5 2:1,1 4:1
6:25 8:8 18:7	misinterpreted	number 1:25	p 1.5 2.1,1 4.1 page 3:2
mathematics	10:20	3:4,10 4:10,11	page 5.2 part 11:21
15:7	misleading	6:6 8:22 9:1,1	participants
matter 1:4 4:9	11:10	9:8,12,17,20,22	17:20
8:24 9:25	mistakes 15:23	numerous 12:1	participation
mcmahon	mollusks 12:6		17:23
11:15,17	monday 4:3	0	particles 13:13
meaning 12:12	motion 3:5,8,11	o 4:1	particular
medical 13:1	3:15 6:7,16,21	oah 1:7 4:11	15:21
medicine 11:24	7:14,19,24 8:3	9:1	particularly
meeting 1:17	8:20 9:5 10:6,9	occur 13:3	13:13
4:6,8,12,14 6:2	18:4,21,23	occurs 12:5	parties 10:5
6:3,15 7:21	19:2	office 4:13	16:7
member 5:1,3,6	move 6:5,8	20:22	party 20:14
5:9,13,22,25	7:15,20 9:6	officer 10:1	party 20.14 passed 12:12
6:8 7:5,7,10,13	moved 18:24	okay 5:20,25	passed 12.12 pat 2:8 5:8 7:12
7:20 8:2,13,15	moves 9:25	once 13:2	8:18 10:8
8:17,19 9:6	multiple 13:9	online 5:5 7:9	18:19
10:8 11:15,17			10.17
10.011.13,17			

[pathologic - respondent]

pathologic	pm 13:13	providing 17:4	recess 7:17	
13:17	point 15:13,15	ptc 9:18,20	recognizable	
	point 15.15,15 post 11:20	15:5	12:24 13:5	
pathologist 11:21	20:22		recognize 11:4	
		public 4:8,16	U	
paula 2:14	practical 9:13	6:10 20:21	16:18	
pending 6:12	preliminary	purdy 2:8 5:8,9	recognized	
people 10:13	8:23	7:12,13 8:18	12:18,20 13:8	
15:21	present 2:10	8:19 10:8,8	record 4:8 6:4	
perce 1:6	4:14 6:4	17:13,14 18:19	8:21	
percent 9:21	prior 9:3 11:22	18:20	recorded 6:15	
periods 13:15	private 11:22	pursuant 6:9	reflect 7:22	
permission	proceedings	puts 17:1	regard 15:19	
11:12	3:3 19:9 20:8	q	regardless	
permit 1:5 4:9	20:11	quality 1:1,4,9	14:22	
8:24	processes 12:4	4:5,7,9,13 8:24	reiterate 13:2	
permitting	13:17	10:19,22 12:8	relative 20:13	
16:10	professor 11:23	14:15 15:16,17	relatively 13:4	
perpetua 1:11	progresses 12:3	15:25	remains 14:23	
4:10 8:25 9:9	progression	quickly 12:15	remand 9:25	
9:13,18	13:10	13:4	remote 2:5,6,7	
person 12:25	project 10:18		2:8	
person's 11:7	10:24 11:9,10	r	replication	
14:22,25	13:12 14:3,6	r 2:1,5 4:1	13:3	
personally	14:13,16 15:3	ract 14:3,8,12	reported 1:25	
15:18	15:8,11	14:20 15:10	reporter 6:3,19	
petition 8:23	projects 14:12	ramifications	20:1,7	
petitioners 1:7	promoted 12:3	6:11	request 6:14	
physical 9:13	promotion	randy 4:22,23	required 14:18	
physiological	13:10	4:23 5:10,15	research 11:19	
12:14	properly 9:10	6:20 7:2 8:10	11:20,21,25	
plans 9:18	9:15	16:9 18:9,10	resolve 7:21	
plants 15:22	proposes 15:5	reached 18:22	resources 1:11	
please 4:14,18	protect 15:20	readily 12:20	4:10 8:25	
8:6 18:5	provided 4:15	received 11:18	respondent	
1 0.0 10.0	Province T.13	-		
		16:15	1:10,12	

[responding - thursday]

responding	second 6:17,18	solid 17:3	submit 9:18
4:24	6:21 8:1,2,4	sorry 17:14	success 15:22
response 19:6	10:7,8,10 18:4	southfork 1:7	suggests 10:24
responsibly 9:8	18:25 19:1,3	special 1:17 4:6	suggests 10.24 summary 16:24
9:12	section 12:7	4:12	support 9:23
review 8:23	15:17	specific 10:18	16:14,18
17:1	see 4:23 12:7	10:24 11:9	supported
right 5:16,20	seeks 13:1	14:16 15:3,8	10:18
7:18	senior 11:19	specifically	surprising
risk 11:3,10,11	serve 10:5	15:16	12:21
12:9 13:23	service 9:3	spent 11:20	
14:7,7,8,10,11	service 9:5 session 3:7 6:7	srl 1:25 20:6,21	t
14:12,17,23,25	6:9 7:15,21,23	si 1.23 20.0,21 ss 20:3	t 14:3,8,12,20
15:2,5	8:21	staff 15:19 17:2	15:10
risks 14:14	set 20:17	stages 12:21	take 4:18 6:1
16:1	share 16:7	stand 19:7	8:4,6 13:4,7
road 9:10,14	sheet 4:15	standard 11:3	18:5
roll 4:18 6:14	short 11:8 14:3	14:10	taken 6:3,14
6:22 8:4,6 18:5	14:13,20 15:11	start 10:14,15	7:22
rolling 15:14	shorthand 20:1	starting 11:7	task 15:20
room 4:14	20:7	12:9	teaching 11:25
route 9:10,14	shortly 17:5	starts 12:10	team 15:19
rpr 1:25 20:21	sighted 11:8	13:7	technical 16:8
rule 15:10,25	sigler 2:6 5:2,3	state 1:2 4:12	17:2
rules 9:17	7:6,7 8:14,15	20:3	term 14:3,13,20
10:19,22 12:8	16:22,23,23	statements 6:2	15:11
14:9,15 15:7	17:7 18:15,16	status 13:11	terms 10:2,4
15:17	19:1	steele 2:7 5:4,6	thank 5:24 7:16
S	sign 4:15	5:22,22,25 7:8	16:2,3,17,20,21
	signature 20:20	7:10 8:2,16,17	17:6,8,12,16,17
s 2:1 4:1	significant	17:9,10 18:17	18:1,12
safety 17:24	10:25	18:18	thanks 5:15,25
salmon 1:7	slowly 12:15	stibnite 9:10,14	think 16:25
save 1:6	smaller 13:13	11:9 13:12	17:24
seal 20:17		14:6	thursday 10:5

[today - yribar]

today 4.17	votorinony
today 4:17 18:22	veterinary 11:23
training 11:25	vice 2:5 5:12,14
transcribed	5:16 6:18 7:3
20:8	8:11 10:16
transcription	18:11
20:11	violate 9:17
tremendous	violates 15:13
17:20	vote 3:6,9,13,16
tribe 1:6	6:14,15,22 8:5
trillion 12:22	vs 1:8
true 20:10	W
try 4:24	want 10:13
trying 17:14	16:14,17 17:23
tumor 12:17	way 11:17
u	we've 5:23
uncontrolled	18:22
12:16 13:3	whereof 20:17
under 20:9	wilson 2:14
underestimates	witness 20:17
11:11	work 17:21,22
understand	18:2
17:21	written 9:3
unmute 17:15	X
18:10	x 3:1
use 15:7	
using 15:7	y
V	yeah 10:14
	year 15:14
variables 12:15	years 11:6 13:4
13:9	13:5,8,25 14:5
variety 13:16	14:13,17,18
various 12:14	15:1,4,5,8
versed 12:1	yribar 2:11
	7:25 10:13

Idaho Rules of Civil Procedure

Rule 30

(e) Review by the Witness; Changes. (1) Unless waived by the deponent and the parties, the deponent must be allowed 30 days after being notified by the officer that the transcript or recording is available in which (A) to review the transcript or recording; and (B) if there are changes in form or substance, to sign a statement listing the changes and the reasons for making them. (2) Changes indicated in the Officer's Certificate. The officer must note in the certificate prescribed by Rule 30 (f) (1) whether a review was requested and, if so, must attach any changes the deponent makes during the 30-day period. (3) Witness Failure to Sign. (A) Ιn General, If the deposition is not signed by the witness within the 30-day period, the officer must sign it and state on the record the fact of the waiver of signature, or of the illness or absence

of the witness or the fact of the refusal to sign the deposition together with any reason given for not signing. (B) Use of Unsigned Deposition. The deposition may be used as if it were signed, unless pursuant to Rule 32 (d)(4) the court determines that the reasons given for the refusal to sign require rejection of the deposition in whole or in part.

DISCLAIMER: THE FOREGOING CIVIL PROCEDURE RULES ARE PROVIDED FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES ONLY. THE ABOVE RULES ARE CURRENT AS OF APRIL 1, 2019. PLEASE REFER TO THE APPLICABLE STATE RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE FOR UP-TO-DATE INFORMATION.

VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS

COMPANY CERTIFICATE AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Veritext Legal Solutions represents that the foregoing transcript is a true, correct and complete transcript of the colloquies, questions and answers as submitted by the court reporter. Veritext Legal Solutions further represents that the attached exhibits, if any, are true, correct and complete documents as submitted by the court reporter and/or attorneys in relation to this deposition and that the documents were processed in accordance with our litigation support and production standards.

Veritext Legal Solutions is committed to maintaining the confidentiality of client and witness information, in accordance with the regulations promulgated under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA), as amended with respect to protected health information and the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, as amended, with respect to Personally Identifiable Information (PII). Physical transcripts and exhibits are managed under strict facility and personnel access controls. Electronic files of documents are stored in encrypted form and are transmitted in an encrypted fashion to authenticated parties who are permitted to access the material. Our data is hosted in a Tier 4 SSAE 16 certified facility.

Veritext Legal Solutions complies with all federal and State regulations with respect to the provision of court reporting services, and maintains its neutrality and independence regardless of relationship or the financial outcome of any litigation. Veritext requires adherence to the foregoing professional and ethical standards from all of its subcontractors in their independent contractor agreements.

Inquiries about Veritext Legal Solutions' confidentiality and security policies and practices should be directed to Veritext's Client Services Associates indicated on the cover of this document or at www.veritext.com.