



Bringing back the birds

February 2, 2024

Regional Forester
U.S. Forest Service
1220 SW 3rd Avenue
Portland, OR 97204

Dear Friends:

Please accept this comment on behalf of American Bird Conservancy which works to conserve birds and their habitats throughout the Americas. The Northwest Forest Plan demonstrates the biodiversity benefits to be gained through an old growth protection policy. It also marks a rare climate change success story by reducing logging emissions, and allowing for continued storage and sequestration in mature and old growth forests. We believe any plan amendment should build upon that success.

We greatly appreciate that President Biden's E.O. 14072 calls particular attention to the importance of Mature and Old-Growth (MOG) forests on Federal lands for their role in contributing to nature-based climate solutions by storing large amounts of carbon and increasing biodiversity. For example, increasing the amount of MOG forests within the range of the Northern Spotted Owl is essential to its recovery, and due to the very high concentrations of carbon found in the region's mature and old growth forests, is also an important strategy needed to ameliorate climate change.

To continue addressing the dual biodiversity and climate crises we recommend the proposed Northwest Forest Plan amendment:

1. Protect all stands 80 years and older. This is the age where forests begin to mature and become suitable Northern Spotted Owl habitat. Given the severe shortage of contiguous old growth in the region, continuing the Northwest Forest Plan restoration strategy and reserve designation are essential to recover the owl and threatened Marbled Murrelet, and at the same time continue and increase climate change benefits.
2. Limit post-fire logging within the late-successional reserves. Other than maintaining public safety, post-fire logging in the reserves should be prohibited.
3. Buffer occupied sites of the threatened Marbled Murrelet, as identified pursuant to the Pacific Sea Bird Group Protocol, from logging, including thinning, by at least 200 meters to prevent edge effects, canopy openings, and entry into the stand by corvids.

Where proposed recommendation number 1. above would have the most effect is on the Plan's designated matrix, non-reserve areas where logging is allowed, which currently is seeing commercial timber sales in owl critical habitat up to 150 years. The owl critical habitat designated in the matrix in 2012 could have and still should be shifted to and managed the same as the reserves. This would

improve the NW Forest Plan and benefit the climate by restricting logging of mature federal forests 80-150 years old.

Although Marbled Murrelet nesting habitat has increased by 2.93 percent, upward trends in murrelet numbers across the range that would be sufficient to recover the population have yet to be detected. We recommend the following:

- The Northwest Forest Plan revision should incorporate the habitat management recommendations for the Marbled Murrelet presented in the forthcoming *Terrestrial Habitat Management Recommendations for Marbled Murrelets*, Pacific Seabird Group Technical Publication Number 7. This document incorporates the best currently available information to provide land managers with strategies for habitat management that support the Marbled Murrelet, many of which can be implemented on federal lands.
- The NWFP revision should include an update of the Northwest Forest Plan Effectiveness Monitoring Program for the Marbled Murrelet. The current every other year population monitoring approach limits the utility of the results and contributes to uncertainty around population trends. The field methods for these surveys as well as the statistical analysis methods should be reviewed and a new strategy developed that will more effectively measure population trends and variation in abundance within conservation zones.

Maintaining a Precautionary Approach

We remain concerned about the degree of political interference in endangered species decisions in the region. This should be considered and precautionary standards provided to ensure that listed species and the late-successional ecosystem will not be harmed or degraded by similar efforts in the future.

For example, the need for new and added protections for mature and old growth forests within the range of the Northern Spotted Owl became gravely apparent when in 2021 the US Fish and Wildlife Service issued a rule exempting 3.4 million acres of Northern Spotted Owl critical habitat from protection. Agency scientists alerted us and warned that in their view, if implemented this flawed rule would cause the eventual extinction of the Northern Spotted Owl. This potentially devastating rule has since been withdrawn.

Attacks on the Marbled Murrelet's ESA status have also been particularly intense. This has included proposals for delisting, and as recently as 2013, eliminating all or most of the murrelet's critical habitat designation. American Bird Conservancy and partners successfully litigated against a flawed Northern Spotted Owl critical habitat rule (2008), and the recently withdrawn critical habitat exemptions rule that allowed for the 3.4 million-acre exemption to Northern Spotted Owl critical habitat in 2021.

Old Growth and a Changing Climate

In a changing climate, old growth forests are also likely to be important refugia for diminishing wildlife populations. In a 2017 study, *Old-growth forests buffer climate-sensitive bird populations from warming*, researchers at Oregon State University's College of Forestry found that two tracked species of songbird—Wilson's Warbler and Hermit Warbler suffering from limited population growth from increasing climate change—were finding refuge in old growth forests.

In a similar follow up study *Forest microclimate and composition mediate long-term trends of breeding bird populations* the authors conclude that "Conservation of old-growth forests, or their characteristics in managed forests, could help slow the negative effects of climate warming on some breeding bird populations via microclimate buffering and possibly insurance effects."

At least five bird species—Swainson's Thrush, Chestnut-backed Chickadee, Hermit Warbler, Varied Thrush and Wilson's Warbler —benefited from the buffering effect provided by cooler microclimates. And, the Wilson's Warbler and the Red Crossbill were found to benefit from the insurance effect provided by complex forest structure. And, it is important to note, that while some species are not dependent on old growth, it is in these high-quality habitats that they reach their maximum densities.

[Assemblages of Bird Species in Western Coniferous Old-Growth Forests](#) found that the Pileated Woodpecker, Goshawk, Vaux's Swift, Townsend's Warbler, and Hermit Thrush are in this category of birds particularly benefitting from old growth forests. The Spotted Owl and its connection to old growth forests are also well-known.

The proposed plan amendment and EO old growth rulemaking should provide needed additional protection to at-risk old growth and mature forests in the Pacific Northwest, northern California National Forests, and to the reserves whose effectiveness is being diminished by post-fire logging. It is also essential to provide the mature and old growth habitat increases needed to recover the owl and murrelet.

Spotted Owl and Fire Management

Relevant to the Threats Analysis and consideration of fire risks, the 2012 Northern Spotted Owl critical habitat rulemaking included controversial elements promoting logging in Northern Spotted Owl habitat to reduce fire risks. To date, these projects have not been shown to benefit the recovery of the Northern Spotted Owl.

The owl is relatively well-adapted to fires, but can be forced to move from an area if the percentage of canopy cover drops too low. Stand replacing fires can cause this degree of habitat loss, as can salvage logging which very frequently is being conducted after low, mixed, and high severity fires. We are concerned that negative impacts being attributed to wildland fire by federal agencies, are in fact, the result of aggressive post-fire logging.

Post-fire logging is a threat to the Northern Spotted Owl by removing features needed for survival such as large snags and downed woody debris that take a long time to form on the landscape. The Northern Spotted Owl recovery action 12 recognizes this issue, but overly aggressive post-fire logging is continuing to degrade Northern and California Spotted Owl habitat. We recommend that the EO provide for added protection for burned mature and old growth forests to ensure that their benefits to wildlife, and the substantial carbon stores that are typically salvage logged today, will not be completely lost.

There is a lack of consistent empirical data on the effectiveness of fuel reduction projects on the National Forests which have now been taking place for the past 30 years. The handful of studies that did look back at what happened to the treated acres found that fires rarely intersected with the project area during the treatment's 10 to 20-year period of effectiveness. In response to the EO, we recommend that an empirical analysis be conducted of all of the federal acres treated for the past 30 years to help better target future fire-risk reduction efforts.

We recommend any Northwest Forest Plan amendment, and conservation rule stemming from the EO to include all public lands under the Bureau of Land Management's jurisdiction in the Pacific Northwest including the Public Domain and O & C Lands. These areas are particularly important for Northern Spotted Owl and Marbled Murrelet recovery.

The proposed 3.4 million-acre Northern Spotted Owl critical habitat exemption proposed by the US Fish and Wildlife Service in 2021 included this important portion of the owl's range. Scientists assessing the rule concluded loss of critical habitat in this area would jeopardize the continued existence of Northern Spotted Owl population.

Northwest Forest Plan: A Rare Climate Change Success Story

Monitoring reports conducted on the Northwest Forest Plan indicate that it is working as intended to restore blocks of mature and old growth forests, and is improving water quality across the entire region. EPA studies indicate that the plan is also helping to fight climate change.

Since protections were put in place for Spotted Owls and salmon under the Northwest Forest Plan, the region's forests have gone from a source of polluting emissions into a carbon sink according to [EPA annual emissions data](#). This is a rare climate change success story that needs to be maintained and built upon. Attached is a letter from scientists on the importance of conserving large trees to address both climate and biodiversity.

The Plan's 20-year monitoring report offers a clear picture of progress within expected parameters:

The maps showed net changes in amount of older forests on federal lands managed under the NWFP have been small (a 2.8 to 2.9 percent net decrease). This occurred despite gross losses from wildfire (4.2 to 5.4 percent), timber harvest (1.2 to 1.3 percent), and from insects or other causes (0.7 to 0.9 percent), suggesting that processes of forest succession have compensated for some of the losses resulting from disturbance. The Plan anticipated a continued decline in older forests for the first few decades until the rate of forest succession exceeds the rate of gross losses. Decadal gross losses of about 5 percent per decade as a result of timber harvesting and wildfire were expected.

Observed losses from wildfire were about what was expected, but losses from timber harvesting were about one quarter of what was anticipated. Results were consistent with expectations for older forest abundance, diversity, and connectivity outcomes for this period of time. Nothing in the findings suggests that attainment of desired outcomes over the next few decades is not feasible; however, we noted some portions of the NWFP federal landscape that had been set back from those outcomes, particularly resulting from large wildfires in the fire-prone portions of the NWFP area.

The Plan assumed a certain amount of loss to fire, and incorporated a redundant reserve design to help ensure connectivity for owl dispersal. However, the potential for an increase in climate-induced large-scale fires is a concern. To reduce potential recovery habitat loss and take of Northern Spotted Owl and Marbled Murrelet, we recommend fire risk reduction activities be limited to stands younger than 80 years.

As these reports indicate, the Northwest Forest Plan is working and offers a strategy to both manage threats appropriately, and to provide for climate refugia for at-risk wildlife. We urge that its protections for endangered species be maintained, and as indicated above, strengthened in three key areas by protecting all stands greater than 80 years, eliminating post-fire logging in the reserves, and increasing the buffer size for logging near occupied Marbled Murrelet habitat to prevent further species decline.

Thank you for considering these comments.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Steve Holmer", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Steve Holmer
Vice President of Policy
American Bird Conservancy
sholmer@abcbirds.org