

President Emeritus
William H. Schlesinger

28 August 2022

VIA <https://cara.fs2c.usda.gov>

Randy Moore
Chief
U.S. Forest Service
1400 Independence Ave. SW
Washington DC 20250

Tracy Stone-Manning
Director
Bureau of Land Management
1849 C Street
Washington DC 20240

Re: Request for Information on Federal Old-growth and Mature Forests

Dear Chief Moore and Director Stone-Manning:

We are writing as experts in climate change and natural resource sciences, responding to a comment [request](#) by the U.S. Forest Service and Bureau of Land Management regarding definitions of old-growth and mature forests on Federal land. Your agencies seek this input as part of implementing the recent [Executive Order](#) on Strengthening the Nation's Forests, Communities, and Local Economies. That order recognizes the importance of mature and old-growth forests in limiting climate change and makes their conservation a national policy. It also sets a number of ambitious goals for the Forest Service and BLM, including "to conserve our mature and old-growth forests on Federal lands and restore the health and vibrancy of our Nation's forests by reducing the threat of catastrophic wildfires through ecological treatments that create resilient forest conditions."

As you consider how to define mature and old-growth forests for these and related purposes, we urge you to provide local officials with straightforward tools that will yield reliable and comparable results for the many different forest types on our nation's public lands. For some decisions, for example about mapping and protecting mature and old-growth stands, forest managers will need definitions that are multi-faceted and location specific. They can, nonetheless, be phrased in terms that are readily applied in the field without specialized expertise. The essential metric for climate mitigation is the amount of carbon stored per acre in aboveground live and dead biomass. For purposes of carbon conservation, because mature and older forests accumulate and store the greatest amount of carbon over time, they could be defined as those with relatively high carbon per unit of ground area, *sensu* Law et al., 2021,¹ among stands of similar species composition within an ecoregion (so delimited as to account for major soil and climate influences). Similarly, a benchmark such as medium to high amounts of critical

¹ Law, B.E., Berner, L.T., Buotte, P.C. *et al.* Strategic Forest Reserves can protect biodiversity in the western United States and mitigate climate change. *Commun Earth Environ* 2, 254 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1038/s43247-021-00326-0>.

Randy Moore and Tracy Stone-Manning

August 28, 2022

Page Two

habitat and species richness can be used to define mature and older forests that are high priority areas to protect for biodiversity purposes. This approach would identify priority mature and older stands to conserve for vital functions within each forest type and region.

Additionally, your agencies should adopt a uniform definition and logging prohibition for large individual mature trees nationwide. These are specimens that provide our most durable above-ground forest carbon storage—even if killed by insects, disease, or fire. They and their carbon could be lost to logging in a variety of ways, even given protection of the most carbon-rich stands (those with high carbon density). Such trees could occur outside stands identified as mature or old-growth, fall to silvicultural treatment of mature stands, and be logged where mature stands are locally abundant. To guard effectively against such avoidable losses of carbon storage, agencies should avoid logging and removal of large mature trees, defined by diameter and height as those that across federal forests hold most of the above-ground carbon density.

The Roadless Rule is a good model for ensuring that when logging is authorized, it does not cause serious losses of carbon. The Forest Service has used that regulation for more than two decades to protect wildlands. It provides local managers with a simple, readily applied prohibition on most logging and associated road-building in unroaded areas over 5,000 acres (and in some cases smaller ones). It has a set of defined exceptions for legal obligations and special considerations, such as fuel management of generally small-diameter trees. And it helps the agency protect some of its—and the public's—most important natural assets from controversial, potentially damaging, and avoidable management impacts.

In summary, straightforward definitions of maturity will support implementation of the executive order in two essential regards. For most ecologically based decision-making, the key areas are those stands with relatively high density of carbon (i.e., tons per acre) and biodiversity per acre (e.g. species richness and critical habitat), for the forest type and ecoregion. And, where logging is authorized in mature stands or younger mixed-aged ones, a simple metric should protect at a minimum the large or old trees that store the most above-ground carbon—just as the Roadless Rule protects wildlands above a minimum size nationally.


Thank you for considering our advice.

Sincerely,

Lead-signatories



William H. Schlesinger
Biogeochemist and President Emeritus
Cary Institute for Ecosystem Studies
Millbrook, New York



Beverly E. Law
Professor Emeritus
College of Forestry
Oregon State University
Corvallis

Randy Moore and Tracy Stone-Manning

August 28, 2022

Page Three

Cosignatories

David D. Breshears
Regents Professor
School of Natural Resources and the
Environment
University of Arizona
Tucson

Norman L. Christensen
Professor and Dean Emeritus
Nicholas School of the Environment
Duke University
Durham, North Carolina

James S. Clark
Nicholas Professor
Nicholas School of the Environment
Duke University
Durham, North Carolina

John M. DeCicco
Research Professor Emeritus
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor

Evan H. DeLucia
G. William Arends Professor Emeritus of
Plant Biology
University of Illinois
Urbana

Jamison Ervin
Manager, Nature for Development
United Nations Development Program
New York, New York

Timothy J. Fahey
Liberty Hyde Bailey Professor
School of Natural Resources
Cornell University
Ithaca, New York

Christine L. Goodale
Frank H.T. Rhodes Professor of
Environmental Science
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary
Biology
Cornell University
Ithaca, New York

Janneke Hille Ris Lambers
Professor of Plant Ecology
ETH Zurich and Faculty Affiliate
University of Washington
Seattle

Tara Hudiburg
Associate Professor
Department of Forest, Rangeland, and Fire
Sciences
University of Idaho
Moscow

Laura Foster Huenneke
Professor Emeritus, Environmental Sciences
Northern Arizona University
Flagstaff

Malcolm Hunter
Professor Emeritus of Wildlife Ecology
University of Maine
Orono

Nancy Huntly
Professor and Executive Director of Ecology
Center
Utah State University
Logan

John S. King
Professor
Department of Forestry and Environmental
Resources
North Carolina State University
Raleigh

Randy Moore and Tracy Stone-Manning

August 28, 2022

Page Four

Dennis H. Knight
Professor Emeritus
Department of Botany
University of Wyoming
Laramie

Michelle C. Mack
Regents Professor of Ecosystem Ecology
Northern Arizona University
Flagstaff

Daniel Markewitz
Professor
Warnell School of Forestry and Natural
Resources
The University of Georgia
Athens

William R. Moomaw
Professor Emeritus
Tufts University
Medford, Massachusetts

Reed Noss
President
Florida Institute for Conservation Science
Melrose, Florida

Gordon Orians
Professor Emeritus of Biology
University of Washington
Seattle

Stephen Pacala
Frederick D. Petrie Professor
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary
Biology
Princeton University
Princeton, New Jersey

Diane E. Pataki
Foundation Professor and Director
School of Sustainability
Arizona State University
Tempe

Robert K. Peet
Research Professor and Professor Emeritus
Department of Biology
University of North Carolina
Chapel Hill

Stuart Pimm
Doris Duke Chair of Conservation
Nicholas School of the Environment
Duke University
Durham, North Carolina

Jennifer S. Powers
Professor
Ecology, Evolution & Behavior
University of Minnesota
St. Paul

Francis E. Putz
Distinguished Professor
Department of Biology
University of Florida
Gainesville

Peter Raven
President, Emeritus
Missouri Botanical Garden
St. Louis, Missouri

Karina V.R. Schäfer
Ecosystem Ecologist
Rutgers University
Newark, New Jersey

Tania Schoennagel
Research Scientist
Institute of Arctic and Alpine Research
University of Colorado
Boulder

Pamela H. Templer
Professor and Chair
Department of Biology
Boston University
Boston, Massachusetts

Randy Moore and Tracy Stone-Manning

August 28, 2022

Page Five

Cesar Terrer
Assistant Professor
Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Cambridge

Richard B. Thomas
Associate Provost of Graduate Academic
Affairs
Professor of Biology
West Virginia University
Morgantown

Stephen C. Trombulak
Professor
Middlebury College
Middlebury, Vermont

Alan Weakley
Director of the Herbarium
University of North Carolina
Chapel Hill

Alan S. White
Professor Emeritus of Forest Ecology
University of Maine
Orono