**Cibola National Forest Mountain Ranger Districts**

***Comment Form for use with***

***Preliminary Draft Plan, Wilderness Process Paper, and all maps***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Document Reviewed (draft plan, wilderness process paper, map)** | **Resource Section** | **Page #** | **Line #** | **Comment** |
| Preliminary  Draft Plan | Soil | 56 | 11 | Burn scars can also be reclaimed by using livestock hoof action for short periods of time and at a lower cost than using equipment. |
|  | Soil | 56 | 38-41 | Areas of disturbance where livestock are concentrated is a function of the amount of time that the soil is exposed to concentration. The less time; the less disturbance |
|  | Groundwater | 57 | 35-39 | Impact of groundwater pumping on surface waters depends on the hydrogeologic connection |
|  | Groundwater  Water Resources Features and Wetland/ Riparian | 58  61 | 17-20  31-32 | Wells that require improvement? What does this consist of? If the well is still a good well it is less expensive to install pipeline to move watering points to a location far enough from surface waters than it is to drill a new well. |
|  |  | 59  61 | 8-9  39-41 | The Supreme Court decision in US v. New Mexico held that the United States, in setting aside the Gila National Forest from other public lands through Presidential proclamations  authorized by the Organic Administration Act of 1897, reserved the use of such waters as may be necessary for the limited purposes for which the land was reserved(those purposes are to secure favorable water flows and to furnish a continuous supply of timber)  and that these purposes did not include recreation, aesthetics, wildlife preservation or cattle grazing. and that any water rights arising from cattle grazing by permittees of the federal government should be adjudicated under state law. As to the issue of whether there exist reserved rights for stockwatering, the Court examined the legislative histories of the forest acts and determined that Congress did not foresee any need for the Forest Service to allocate water for stockwatering. The Court found therefore that there are no reserved rights for this purpose and affirmed the lower court holding that these rights must be acquired under state law. The problem with obtaining water rights from the state is that the Forest Service's desired use might not constitute a  recognized beneficial use under state law and would therefore not give rise to a valid water right. Additionally, the priority date of such a right would be junior to all other rights acquired before it. |
|  | Water Resources Features and Wetland/ Riparian | 61 | 23-24 | Erosion and Trampling from designated points of use is a result of the length of time livestock are exposed to the designated points. These should be moved frequently to avoid erosion and trampling. |
|  | Range and Grazing | 80 | 40-42 | Adaptive grazing management needs to consider both production and conservation goals. A practical definition of Adaptive Management may be that it is “the process of making  use of monitoring information to determine if management changes are needed, and if so, what changes, and to what degree.” It is a process that allows us to deal with uncertainty and changing conditions over time. . Decisions impacting adaptive management changes should be based on quantitative, repeatable measurements collected at multiple spatial and temporal scales. The permittee, in order to be economically viable and successful, needs to be invov\lved in the decisions regarding management changes . |
|  |  | 83 | 26 | **Collaboration** is the act of working together in a joint project.  **Cooperatio**n is the association of persons acting jointly or concurrently toward a common benefit.  **Co-ordination** is the unification, integration, synchronization of the efforts of group members so as to provide unity of action in the pursuit of common goals.  **Consultation** is the act of exchanging information and opinions about something in order to reach a better understanding of it or to make a decision, or a meeting for this purpose.  Cooperation, coordination, and consultation work toward a common goal whereas, collaboration is not goal oriented.  USFS will be more successful in achieving goals if they coordinate, cooperate, and consult with permittees, other users, and local governments than to collaborate on issues. |
|  | Management Areas and Designated Areas | 131 | 37 | Professional judgement can be a subjective decision. Overuse causing unacceptable resource damage and the subsequent decision to change the use should be based on monitoring studies and not capricious or arbitrary decisions based on "professional judgement". |
|  |  |  |  |  |